



National identities in conflict and peace process.
A comparative analysis of
Northern Ireland and the Basque Country
1968-2011

Volume 1 of 2

Pascal Pragnère

The thesis is submitted to University College Dublin in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

It was completed under a co-tutelle international agreement with the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (EHESS), Paris

School of Politics and International Relations

Head of School: Professor David Farrell

Principal Supervisors:

Professor Jennifer Todd, UCD

Professor Laura Lee Downs, EHESS and EUI

Doctoral Studies Panel Membership:

Professor Michael Keating, University of Aberdeen

Professor Xavier Crettiez, Université Versailles Saint-Quentin

Professor David Farrell, UCD

Professor John Coakley, UCD

January 2013

Table of contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	3
ABSTRACT	8
<i>Statement of Original Authorship:</i>	9
TABLE OF FIGURES	10
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	11
<i>Basque Country</i>	11
<i>Northern Ireland</i>	12
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	14
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	16
PRESENTATION.....	17
RESEARCH QUESTIONS	17
WHY STUDY PARTY TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY DEFINITIONS IN CONFLICTS?	17
<i>Identity changes –general framework</i>	17
<i>Party definitions of national identity and popular conceptions</i>	19
INTEREST AND IMPLICATIONS. FROM TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY DEFINITIONS TO CONDITIONS OF CONFLICT.....	20
LITERATURE ON NATIONALISM AND NATIONAL IDENTITY CHANGES	21
<i>In Northern Ireland</i>	22
<i>In the Basque Country</i>	24
<i>Comparisons</i>	27
CONCEPTUAL DISCUSSION AND DEFINITIONS.....	28
<i>Identity / identification</i>	28
<i>Identity change / transformation of identity definition</i>	29
<i>Transformations of national identity definitions –category and content</i>	30
<i>Nature and significance of definitions: civic, political, ethnic, cultural, ethno-class</i>	31
OPERATIONALIZING THE QUESTIONS	34
<i>Hypotheses</i>	35
CASE SELECTION AND CONTEXT: NORTHERN IRELAND AND THE BASQUE COUNTRY.....	36
<i>Supranational dimension</i>	36
<i>Origins of nationalism</i>	37
<i>Contemporary phase of conflict</i>	40
<i>Democratization and institutional transformation</i>	42

<i>Structure of the conflict and actors</i>	43
<i>Population structure</i>	44
<i>Comparisons</i>	45
METHOD AND SOURCES.....	46
<i>Historical approach</i>	46
<i>Comparative approach</i>	47
<i>Data analysis</i>	48
<i>Sequences of conflict</i>	49
<i>Sources</i>	49
STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS.....	50
CHAPTER 2 : HOW POLITICAL ORGANIZATIONS DEFINED NATIONAL IDENTITY IN THE BASQUE COUNTRY	51
INTRODUCTION.....	52
<i>Aims</i>	52
<i>Sources</i>	52
<i>Method</i>	53
<i>Literature - general</i>	54
THE PARTIDO NACIONALISTA VASCO (PNV).....	55
<i>Evolutions of the PNV</i>	55
<i>PNV definitions of national identity</i>	59
EUZKADI TA AZKATASUNA (ETA)	75
<i>Evolutions of ETA</i>	75
<i>ETA definitions of national identity</i>	78
HERRI BATASUNA (HB) –BATASUNA	92
<i>Evolutions of HB</i>	92
<i>HB definitions of national identity</i>	94
EUSKO ALKARTASUNA (EA)	101
<i>Evolutions of EA</i>	101
<i>EA evolutions of national identity</i>	102
CONCLUSION.....	106
CHAPTER 3: HOW POLITICAL ORGANIZATIONS DEFINED NATIONAL IDENTITY IN NORTHERN IRELAND	108
INTRODUCTION	109
<i>Aims</i>	109
<i>Sources</i>	109

<i>Method of exploration</i>	112
<i>Literature focuses</i>	113
<i>National identity definitions: a complementary focus</i>	113
IRA.....	114
<i>Evolutions of the IRA</i>	114
<i>IRA definitions of national identity</i>	119
SINN FÉIN	126
<i>Evolutions of Sinn Féin</i>	126
<i>Sinn Féin definitions of national identity</i>	130
OFFICIAL IRA.....	141
<i>Evolutions of the Official IRA</i>	141
<i>Official IRA definitions of national identity</i>	142
OFFICIAL SINN FÉIN	144
<i>Evolutions of Official Sinn Féin</i>	144
<i>Official Sinn Féin's definitions of national identity</i>	144
REPUBLICAN SINN FÉIN	145
<i>Evolutions of Republican Sinn Féin</i>	145
<i>Republican Sinn Féin definitions of national identity</i>	146
PEOPLE'S DEMOCRACY	148
<i>Evolutions of People's Democracy</i>	148
<i>People's Democracy definitions of national identity</i>	149
SDLP	155
<i>Evolutions of the SDLP</i>	155
<i>SDLP's definitions of national identity</i>	157
CONCLUSION.....	169
CHAPTER 4: PATTERNS OF TRANSFORMATIONS – COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS	170
INTRODUCTION	171
TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY DEFINITIONS	172
<i>Transformations in content</i>	172
<i>Changes in category</i>	173
<i>Nature and strategic purpose of transformations</i>	173
<i>Sequences of transformations</i>	174
<i>Saliency of definitions</i>	176
<i>Functions of criteria</i>	178
PATTERNS OF TRANSFORMATIONS	180
<i>Moving boundaries</i>	180

<i>Category evolutions</i>	181
<i>Transforming conceptions of national identity and nationalism</i>	182
<i>Unstable and varying conceptions of national identity</i>	188
<i>Conclusion and theoretical implications: reassessing the ethnic-civic dichotomy</i>	190
CHAPTER 5: TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY DEFINITIONS BY POLITICAL ORGANIZATIONS: STRATEGIES AND RATIONALE.....	193
INTRODUCTION.....	194
<i>Specificities of the organizations</i>	195
<i>Internal debate</i>	195
<i>Analysis of causes</i>	197
<i>Comparative framework</i>	197
REJECTED FACTORS.....	199
<i>Evolution of mentalities</i>	199
<i>Changes in socio-economic conditions</i>	200
<i>Changes in models of reference</i>	201
EXTERNAL FACTORS.....	201
<i>Fall of the Berlin Wall</i>	201
<i>Globalization</i>	203
<i>European integration</i>	204
<i>Institutional change –between external and internal</i>	205
<i>Conclusion: indirect factors</i>	207
INTERNAL FACTORS: LEGITIMACY FOR REPRESENTATION OF NATIONALISM.....	208
<i>Violence, ideology, nationalism</i>	208
<i>Management of group boundaries: support-gathering strategies</i>	209
<i>Intra-bloc competition for legitimacy of representation of nationalism</i>	216
<i>Changes in conditions: intensity of violence</i>	228
CONCLUSION.....	231
CHAPTER 6 – HOW DO PARTY TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY DEFINITIONS RELATE WITH POPULAR PERCEPTIONS AND VIOLENCE?	233
INTRODUCTION.....	234
BACKGROUND.....	235
<i>National identity, violence and peace</i>	236
DATA.....	237
PARTY TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY AND VOTE	239
<i>Transformations of definitions and votes in Northern Ireland</i>	240

<i>Transformations of definitions and votes in the Basque Country</i>	242
<i>Definition transformations and votes: common trends across cases</i>	245
PARTY TRANSFORMATIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY AND POPULAR PERCEPTIONS	246
<i>National identity and community identification in Northern Ireland</i>	246
<i>Correlation between party affinity and national identity category</i>	247
<i>Correlation between party affinity and supra-national identification</i>	251
<i>Correlation between party affinity and national identity content</i>	254
<i>Do specific national identifications correlate with party preference?</i>	263
PARTY DEFINITIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY, VIOLENCE AND PEACE	269
CONCLUSION.....	271
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION	272
PRIMARY SOURCES QUOTED	281
NORTHERN IRELAND	281
<i>IRA</i>	281
<i>SINN FEIN</i>	282
<i>OFFICIAL IRA</i>	284
<i>OFFICIAL SINN FEIN</i>	284
<i>REPUBLICAN SINN FEIN</i>	285
<i>PEOPLE'S DEMOCRACY</i>	285
<i>SDLP</i>	286
THE BASQUE COUNTRY	289
<i>PNV</i>	289
<i>ETA</i>	291
<i>HERRI BATASUNA / EUSKAL HERRITARROK / BATASUNA</i>	293
<i>EUSKO ALKARTASUNA</i>	294
BIBLIOGRAPHY – SECONDARY SOURCES	296

Table of figures

<i>Table 1: Conceptions of national identity – the Basque Country</i>	186
<i>Table 2: Conceptions of national identity – Northern Ireland</i>	187
<i>Table 3: definitions of national identity: conceptions, character, potential effects or aims</i>	192
<i>Table 4: Vote evolution (%) and party conceptions of national identity in Northern Ireland 1969-2010</i>	240
<i>Table 5: Vote evolution (%) and party conceptions of national identity in the Basque Country 1977-2011</i>	242
<i>Table 6: Correlation between party proximity and national identification –category, Northern Ireland 1978-2010 (%)</i>	248
<i>Table 7: National identification among party supporters (category), Basque Country 1977-2011 (%)</i>	250
<i>Table 8: National and supra-national identification, Northern Ireland 2001 (%)</i>	252
<i>Table 9: Self-identification as a citizen of Europe, Basque Country 1996 (%)</i>	253
<i>Table 10: Self-identification among party supporters, Northern Ireland 1998-2001 (%)</i>	255
<i>Table 11: Reasons for being truly Irish –content, Northern Ireland, 1999-2008 (%)</i>	257
<i>Table 12: Conditions to be Basque among party supporters, Basque Country 1977-2005 (%)</i>	259
<i>Table 13: Factors that make the Basque Country a nation according to party supporters, 1992-1996 (%)</i>	261
<i>Table 14: Voting preference of people who consider themselves as [national identity], Northern Ireland, 2007 (%)</i>	264
<i>Table 15: voting preference of people who consider that X criterion (content) is important for being truly Irish, Northern Ireland, 1999-2008 (%)</i>	266
<i>Table 16: Voting preference of people who consider themselves as [national identity], Basque Country, 2011 (%)</i>	267
<i>Table 17: Voting preference of people who consider that X is the most important criterion for being Basque, Basque Country, 2005 (%)</i>	268