

Appendix: Presences, categories and indicators

	Categories	Indicators	Our codes	Sample illustrative quotations
Social Presence	Affective	NetSpeak		"*sigh* At least there's a next time!"
		Humor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Playing with language 	Laura, kindly allow me to "ventriloquate" you.
		Self-Disclosure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expressing vulnerability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Critiquing own abilities as teacher ◦ Critiquing own pedagogical practice • Reflecting on own learning experience • Expressing a feeling 	
	Interactive	Awareness of the community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responding to colleague's request for feedback/advice • Responding to colleague's request for information • Seeking advice from colleagues • Seeking feedback from colleagues • Referring explicitly to content of peers' messages 	"However, how much borrowing do you think is too much?"
		Recognition of peers' contributions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Acknowledging colleague's contribution • Affirming a colleague • Agreeing with a colleague • Agreeing with others or content of peers' posts 	"I think you made a really good point about a potential paradox in reading."
	Cohesive	Vocatives		"Laura, you are not the only one."
		Inclusive pronouns or words	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of "WE" to index group of novice teachers • Use of "WE" to index group of MA students learning teaching methods 	"I think a great way to do this is by incorporating social online reading platforms (such as the one we are using now) in our own classrooms."

		Phatics, salutations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Thanking a colleague ● Greeting a colleague 	"Caitlin and Heather, thank you!"
		Empathy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Encouraging a colleague ● Expressing solidarity with colleague ● sharing a feeling 	"Gabrielle, I have a hard time with this as well!"
Cognitive Presence	Triggering Event	Recognizing a problem	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Critiquing institutional pedagogical practice ● Disagreeing with author or text ● Disagreeing with colleague ● Expressing challenges ● Experiencing conflict with proposition 	"A..., I don't think that being able to figure out where a student is going with their thoughts necessarily earns them a good grade, do you?"
		Sense of puzzlement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Grappling with concepts ● Grappling with application of concepts ● Expressing skepticism ● Expressing resistance ● Expressing a concern ● Questioning for information ● Questioning reflectively 	"If this is the case, it will be hard for me to follow this practice because it goes against the way I thought the organization of a text should be."
	Exploration	Information exchange	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Sharing pedagogical experiences ● Stating a fact ● Describing experience ● Expressing belief ● Sharing learning experience 	"Classrooms and teaching are fluid (just like student's motivation) and it is impossible to think of them as a static, controlled situation."
		Demonstrating intellectual curiosity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressing curiosity 	

		Brainstorming	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Making value judgment (positive and negative) ● Reflecting on institutional practice 	"At the end of our discussion on chapters 1-3, I had them make predictions and some of the stuff they came up with was great."
		Leaping to conclusions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Stating an opinion 	"If the teacher has to dig and wonder and interpret to try and figure out the gist of it, then I think the point is moot."
	Integration	Convergence—among group members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Acknowledging and elaborating on colleague's contribution ● Expanding by giving example ● Elaborating on idea ● Elaborating on colleague's previous contribution 	"Gabrielle, if you ask me I think that neither of the two exchange patterns are entirely wrong."
		Connecting ideas/synthesis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Connecting w/ course concepts ● Connecting with other concepts ● Connecting concept and pedagogical tool ● Connecting affectively with text ● Connecting affectively with concept ● Restating opinion ● Restating concept or knowledge ● Agreeing with author and elaborating ● Reflecting on practice ● Reflecting on students ● Agreeing/aligning with author & text 	"Instead of treating reading as a solidarity, secretive act, reading should be seen as a social and cultural act that requires cognitive reasoning."

		Creating solutions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressing desire to appropriate pedagogical tool ● Identifying solutions to challenges ● Sharing pedagogical strategies 	"Semantic mapping is also another activity that I would like to incorporate in my FL classes!"
	Resolution	Applying new ideas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Advocating for classroom technique ● Advocating for curricular/pedagogical approach ● Applying new constructed knowledge ● Brainstorming pedagogical techniques ● Revising prior beliefs ● Summarizing ideas ● Identifying solutions to challenges 	"I am trying to have my students do this for Mariana—not everything suggested in this passage, but just recording new vocab and track character progression."
		Reaching conclusions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Reaching conclusions 	"It's only through interaction with a human being that texts are transformed into meaning."
		Reflecting on learning processes/outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Acknowledging evolving beliefs ● Acknowledging learning new concept ● Acknowledging learning new pedagogical tool ● Reflecting on beliefs ● Reflecting on new learning 	"I have never thought before about language being such a tool/weapon/social placer."
Teaching Presence	Instructional Management	Designing and organizing		
	Building Understanding	Facilitating online discourse	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Prompting colleague's reflection (on practice) 	"I wanted to ask if you could see yourself implementing this sort of activity in a 101 course?"
	Direct Instruction	Intellectual and scholarly leadership	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Explaining or defining a concept ● Interpreting author meaning 	"It's the difference between telling students what the text is about and giving students clues and scaffolds to help them arrive at meanings."

Adapted from: Tirado Morueta, Maraver López, Hernando Gómez, & Harris (2016) and Arnold & Ducate (2006).