Archipel

Études interdisciplinaires sur le monde insulindien

101 | 2021

Varia

Elke Papelitzky, *Writing World History in Late Ming China and the Perception of Maritime Asia*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz, East Asian Maritime History 15, 2020, 240 p., Index, 38 Tables, 14 Figures. ISBN 978-3-447-11309-0

Claudine Salmon

Édition électronique

URL : <https://journals.openedition.org/archipel/2450>

DOI : 10.4000/archipel.2450

ISSN : 2104-3655

Éditeur

Association Archipel

Édition imprimée

Date de publication : 30 juin 2021

Pagination : 258-260

ISBN : 978-2-910513-85-6

ISSN : 0044-8613

Référence électronique

Claudine Salmon, « Elke Papelitzky, *Writing World History in Late Ming China and the Perception of Maritime Asia*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz, East Asian Maritime History 15, 2020, 240 p., Index, 38 Tables, 14 Figures. ISBN 978-3-447-11309-0 », *Archipel* [En ligne], 101 | 2021, mis en ligne le 30 juin 2021, consulté le 02 juillet 2021. URL : <http://journals.openedition.org/archipel/2450> ; DOI : <https://doi.org/10.4000/archipel.2450>

Association Archipel

denounced, and forced to flee to the forest, surviving in caves and raiding garden plots near the edges of settlement, isolated and starving, before finally being captured. Unlike the victims of the 1965 massacres, those captured were usually arrested, imprisoned and even tried in a semblance of legal retribution, an attempt to present the New Order as controlled and orderly. Some survivors, finally released from about 1979, were Hearman's informants.

Hearman then turns to the cruel effects of the counter-insurgency campaign on the villagers themselves, a few of whom also testified, anonymously, to Hearman years later. The army extended strict control over the population, recruiting spies, turncoats and informers. In the name of development, it built roads and compelled villagers, whose houses had been dispersed near their fields, to move near the roads. There, they had opportunities for better mobility and even cash incomes, but concentration meant military and administrative supervision and isolation—villagers were mingled with settlers from other villages in the new settlements. Land tenure became an issue as well. In an area of largely nominal adherence to religious practices, the military promoted both Pancasila and Islam, building or repairing mosques and prayer houses, enabling religious instruction, hoping to counteract the supposedly atheistic core of communism. Its campaign did not, in contrast to the practice of late 1965, cooperate with NU or its adherents. If anything, the officers kept their distance from what was the most influential religious organization in the province.

If the military's operation succeeded in wiping out the last remnants of the PKI in Java, it also succeeded in suppressing the population. Visiting the area even several years after the dissolution of the New Order in 1998, journalists and researchers noted the reluctance of the villagers to speak, not only with outsiders, but with each other.

Mary Somers Heidhues
Göttingen, Germany

Elke Papelitzky, *Writing World History in Late Ming China and the Perception of Maritime Asia*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz, East Asian Maritime History 15, 2020, 240 p., Index, 38 Tables, 14 Figures. ISBN 978-3-447-11309-0

In this ten-chapter book (based on her dissertation), Elke Papelitzky examines in great detail how certain late Ming scholars became interested in foreign countries and their relations with the Middle Kingdom after the lifting of the ban on maritime trade in 1567, i.e. at a time when the empire was threatened on its northern border¹⁵ and the tributary relations with the various Asian countries were undermined by the new situation of the global trade system. In order to do this, the author explains in the introduction (Chap. 1), how she selected seven works, some better known than others, from the 1570s to the first three decades of the 17th century, which she considers to be "world histories" although the term is hardly used by those concerned. These are, in chronological order, the *Shuyu zhouchi lu* 殊域周諮錄 or "Records of the Dispatches Concerning Various Regions" the *Xianbing lu* 咸賓錄 or "Records of all Guests,"

15. The Ming dynasty was to be overthrown by the Manchus in 1644.

the *Siyi guangji* 四夷廣記 or “Extensive Records of All Barbarians,” the *Yisheng* 裔剩 or “Historical Records of Distant Peoples,” the *Huangming xiangxu lu* 皇明象胥錄 or “Records of the Interpreter of the Glorious Ming,” the *Siyiguan kao* 四夷館考 or “Thoughts from the Translation Office,” and finally the second part of the *Fangyu shenglüe* 方輿勝略 ou “Complete Survey of the World.”¹⁶

In Chapter 2, the author gives a historical overview of the tributary system and how, since the Han, the Chinese have written about “barbarians” and the categories into which they are placed. The next three chapters present the characteristics of the selected texts: editions, existing prints and manuscripts,¹⁷ biographies of the authors (all are from southern China: Zhejiang, Fujian, Jiangxi, Anhui, Hubei) all of whom except one served as officials, the structure of the texts, and paratexts including maps, illustrations, prefaces, and *fanli* 凡例, disclaimers, or explanatory notes.

Chapter 6 (pp. 67-85) looks more specifically at the content of the books. The seven texts deal with some 205 countries, excluding the minority regions of the empire. Sixteen appear in all the books, these are China’s closest neighbours, some western countries, as well as some of those visited by Admiral Zheng He 鄭和 (1371-1433); others appear in only one or two books. A list of the most frequently appearing countries is given in Table 7 (p. 72). Next, the author considers at length how the said countries are broken down, generally more or less according to traditional categories, with the exception of Shen Maoshang 慎懋賞, the author of the *Siyi guangji*, who coined the *haiguo* 海國 or “maritime countries” category under which he places all those in the southern regions. Papelitzky notes that the countries the authors expand on the most are those in the north and west, presumably because of the military threat they pose to the empire’s borders.

This then leads her to ask the question of the authors’ motivations, which are in fact quite diverse and not always obvious. For some, these are clearly expressed in their preface or warning. For example, Yan Congjian 嚴從簡 (fl. 1559-1575), the author of the *Shuyu Zhouzi lu*, who has a great deal of professional experience – he had access to the official archives and reproduces various extracts from imperial edicts and memorials – stated that he wished to transmit his knowledge to posterity. Indeed, this work was widely used by the other authors. Luo Yuejiong 羅曰褰 (fl. 1585-1597), the author of the *Xianbin lu* explained that he was exclusively interested in foreigners who continued to bring tribute, hence the title given to his work. He was convinced that foreigners were descendants of Chinese, a worldview that dates back to the Han. Mao Ruicheng 毛瑞徵 (fl. 1597-1636), the author of the *Huangming xiangxu lu*, on the other hand, was dissatisfied with the existing accounts and intended to add to them. He deplored the fact that the Portuguese were not included and that, more generally, the information was not up to date. He was concerned about national security and the threats posed by the “barbarians of the north” and pirates along the coasts of Zhejiang and Fujian. This is why he decided to write his own book to improve knowledge. This concern for safety and knowledge was shared by Wang Zongzai 王宗載 (fl. 1562-

16. Only the *Shuyu Zhouzi lu* and the *Xianbin lu*, from which the other works borrow more or less extensively, have been the subject of a modern edition punctuated and annotated. Some of the other “world histories” are available online.

17. For this purpose, the author uses the following bibliography: Wolfgang Franke and Foon Ming Liew-Herres, *Annotated Sources of Ming History. Including Southern Ming and Works on Neighbouring Lands 1368-1661*, 2 vols, Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 2011.

1582), the author of the *Siyi guangji* who interviewed a Siamese envoy to complete the written sources.

Chapters 7-9 (pp. 86-168) constitute three case studies relating to Siam, Malacca and Portugal. The way in which the seven works presented these entities geographically and historically, as well as their diplomatic, tributary, and even commercial links with China, their customs, their productions, and their foreign policy, and finally the maritime routes linking them to the Ming Empire (sometimes presented in great detail, see Figure 13, p. 17), is analyzed here in a comparative manner. In some cases, the authors give an overall assessment (mitigated for Siam, often judged too bellicose towards its neighbours, good for Malacca and rather negative for Portugal).¹⁸

Although these world histories have many differences, they share some commonalities as well. While the authors have made an effort to enrich their documentation, some even taking the trouble to list their sources, they do not, strictly speaking, criticize them and simply accumulate them in their own work. Moreover, they remain attached to the traditional worldview according to which foreigners must bring tribute to the glorious Ming. Their worldview is therefore selective, to the extent that they sometimes deliberately ignore facts; for example, some authors refuse to give information about the Portuguese, whose presence on the southern coasts threatens the established order. However, the author of the *Siyi guangji*, as well as those of the *Fangyu shenglüe* and the *Huangming xiangxu lu* are more open and accept reality. These are the main lines drawn by the author.

Overall, these texts reveal the world view of a group of scholars who had never crossed borders but who had certain intellectual and even kinship links between them. This overall vision of the Asian maritime regions would undoubtedly benefit from being considered in relation to that (or those) emerging from contemporary Portuguese narratives. Moreover, if we move from a macro view of maritime Asia to a micro view of the various “maritime countries”, it must be said that the notes contained in these works are very rich in original historical details, which would benefit from being more widely used by historians working on South-East Asia in general and Insulindia in particular. In short, this study by Papelitzky opens the way to new and promising research.

Claudine Salmon

Gregor Benton 班國瑞, Huimei Zhang 張慧梅, Hong Liu 劉宏 (Ed.), *Chinese Migrants Write Home / 二十世紀華人移民書信選注. A Dual-Language Anthology of Twentieth-Century Family Letters*, Singapore: World Scientific Publishing Co, 2020, 334 p. Numerous plates. ISBN 9789813274921

This book is a collection of letters in Chinese covering the period 1902-1980s and their English translations. These letters come from emigrants who lived in Southeast Asia (Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand, the Philippines) as well as in the United States and Canada, but also from family members who remained in China. They come from several

¹⁸. Under the Ming, the rumor was that the Portuguese ate children, and they were considered to be very violent, well-equipped militarily, and therefore dangerous.