Boudet JEAN-PATRICE *et al.* (dir.), *Pierre d'Ailly. Un esprit universel à l'aube du XV^e siècle*

Paris, Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, 2019, 420 p.

Christopher M. Bellitto

Electronic version

URL: <https://journals.openedition.org/assr/64114>

DOI: 10.4000/assr.64114

ISSN: 1777-5825

Publisher

Éditions de l'EHESS

Printed version

Date of publication: 4 December 2021

Number of pages: 195-196

ISBN: 9782713228735

ISSN: 0335-5985

Electronic reference

Christopher M. Bellitto, "Boudet JEAN-PATRICE *et al.* (dir.), *Pierre d'Ailly. Un esprit universel à l'aube du XV^e siècle*", *Archives de sciences sociales des religions* [Online], 196 | octobre-décembre 2021, Online since 01 December 2021, connection on 13 February 2022. URL: <http://journals.openedition.org/assr/64114> ; DOI: <https://doi.org/10.4000/assr.64114>

This text was automatically generated on 13 February 2022.

© Archives de sciences sociales des religions

Boudet JEAN-PATRICE *et al.* (dir.), *Pierre d'Ailly. Un esprit universel à l'aube du XV^e siècle*

Paris, Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, 2019, 420 p.

Christopher M. Bellitto

REFERENCES

Boudet JEAN-PATRICE *et al.* (dir.), *Pierre d'Ailly. Un esprit universel à l'aube du XV^e siècle*. Paris, Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, 2019, 420 p.

- 1 This volume of collected essays is a noteworthy example of the broader lens that has been turned to Pierre d'Ailly (1350-1420) in the last several decades. In fact, d'Ailly is enjoying something of a renaissance that goes well beyond the long-standing portrait of him as primarily a church statesman. He has been rescued here and in recent scholarship from both the uncritical portrait of a brilliant and noble French intellectual hero in the first modern biography by Louis Salembier (1932) as well as from the sharp indictment by Bernard Guenée (1987) of d'Ailly as a craven, driven, and opportunistic political creature. While his protégé and successor as Parisian chancellor Jean Gerson (1363-1429) has more typically been taken to stand for his age, d'Ailly is now emerging as a far more complex figure than Salembier and Guenée would have us think. This volume bears testimony to that reassessment of a man who was admittedly more overtly political than Gerson. There was never a time when d'Ailly was not calculating, but he was also a writer of a wide range of topics beyond scholastic philosophy and theology. He was rector of Paris' center of humanism in the Collège de Navarre and a bishop who eventually came to be more pastorally concerned with his clergy and flock in Cambrai (1397-1411) than as an absentee bishop in Le Puy (1395-1397). As this volume's four parts demonstrate, he was also working on astrology and cosmography, canon law, spirituality, and ecclesiology.

- 2 In the first part, we encounter d'Ailly's writings on geography and cosmography. Nathalie Bouloux demonstrates his debt to Roger Bacon in his *Imago mundi*, *Epilogus mape mundi*, and an annotation of Ptolemy's *Geography*. C. Philipp E. Nothaft breaks ground by discussing his *Tractatus de vero cyclo lunari*, providing a critical edition of this calendar reform that bore little immediate fruit but was known to scholars undertaking Pope Gregory XIII's 1582 overhaul. Christopher Schabel redates d'Ailly's commentaries on Boethius *De consolazione philosophiæ* and Lombard's *Sentences*, reversing the standard order to assert that the Boethius commentaries came first at the very start of his teaching career in 1370.
- 3 Part II looks at d'Ailly the theologian. Joël Biard discusses philosophy as the handmaiden of d'Ailly's ontology, epistemology, and semiotics. Olivier Ribordy, like Schabel, revisits d'Ailly's questions on Boethius and adds analysis of *Tractatus de anima* to argue that d'Ailly did not think free will was fully eclipsed by a determinism of the stars. John T. Slotemaker continues his precise work on d'Ailly's theological principles by discussing divine distinctions in his commentaries on the *Sentences*, delivering him from the charge of unoriginality. Moving from theory to practice, Monique Maillard-Luypaert considers d'Ailly's investigation into two incidents concerning the Eucharist during his time in Cambrai: an earlier desecration and a contemporary claim of Christ's blood on an altar cloth. Ludovic Nys offers an intriguing discussion of d'Ailly's planned funerary monument.
- 4 To begin Part III devoted to ecclesiology, Fabrice Delivré and Bénédicte Sère carefully reexamine d'Ailly as a conciliarist. D'Ailly was not an ideologue: he was a pragmatic, cautious, and ultimately oligarchic conciliarist who saw conciliarism as a necessary means to solve the Great Western Schism. Émilie Rosenblieh moves the topic forward to d'Ailly's posthumous influence at the drawn-out Council of Basel (1431-1445), noting accurately that his emphasis on conciliation demonstrated that he was a moderate and even reluctant conciliarist who would not logically appeal to the radical wing opposing Pope Eugenius IV to the bitter end. Olivier Marin provides an unexpected interest in d'Ailly. While no one is surprised to find hostility to d'Ailly among Bohemian reformers because of his role in the condemnation and execution of Jan Hus at the Council of Constance in 1415, Marin reveals that Czech Carthusians were interested in his ecclesiological texts as well as devotionals attributed to or influenced by him.
- 5 Part IV concludes with legacies. Monica Brînzei studies the trail of manuscripts of d'Ailly's work in Germanic lands, which surprises in the same way as Marin's article. Laura Ackerman Smoller colorfully recounts d'Ailly's dating of the end of the world to 1789 and its importance to France in the decades before and after that year; this chapter would more successfully have served the volume as the final selection because of the topic and Smoller's eminence as a d'Ailly scholar. Jacob Schmutz, like Marin and Brînzei, turns our attention elsewhere – and quite profitably – by examining d'Ailly's influence on Puritan Calvinism in Holland and New England by way of Spanish Catholics.
- 6 A conclusion by Jean-Patrice Boudet belongs more as an introduction; students should be directed to read this first since it lays out chronology, context, and rubrics of d'Ailly's career and writings. Throughout, the volume is also valuable because of the attention many authors pay to manuscript traditions. This attention is supplemented by Monica Brînzei's brief but useful description of five manuscripts in the Bibliothèque Mazarine, one of the conference sponsors, accompanied by five high quality plates. The

volume includes an extensive bibliography and an index devoted to manuscripts and archival documents. Gilbert Ouy would have been pleased.