Safe city free of violence against women and girls is a safe city for everyone Egypt’s experience

Maya Morsy
SAFE CITY FREE OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS IS A SAFE CITY FOR EVERYONE
EGYPT’S EXPERIENCE

MAYA MORSY has been working with the United Nations Development Fund For Women (UNIFEM) from 1999 to date. Dr. Morsy started the work of UNIFEM in Egypt with one initiative, which is now reaching out over more than 30 initiatives. She has a PHD on Public Policies from the Arab Regional Academic Institute, The League of Arab States organization on Public Policies and Women Human Security in the Arab Region and a Master of Business Administration and Master of Public Administration from City University in Seattle; and a Bachelor of Arts in Political Science with a minor in Mass Communication from the American University in Cairo. Her text is a professional examination of the Safe Cities Programme in Cairo and its potential to improve the plight of women who suffer harassment in public spaces.

SETTING THE SCENE

Peaceful participation in the region, to demand political change, has deep social impact and opens up dramatic opportunities for gender empowerment and the advancement of social justice. The fact that women have been equal participants in this moment of vibrant, spontaneous and mass citizen action to demand political change is really something. Forgetting the needs and demands, the participation in the decision making process might also be the other fact that women's agenda could face. “The Egyptian revolution is not just about toppling a political regime; there is more to it. It is about realizing the meaning of being HUMAN regardless of your gender, ethnicity, religion and social
background. This is not a philosophical or spiritual perspective; it is a reality, a true one. An experience lived by those who positively participated and supported the revolution.”

In Tahrir Square and during the revolution, all of the media assured us that there was not a single case of sexual harassment. Egyptian Women and Men from all over Egypt stood side by side, and still, not a single case of sexual harassment. Personally, I thought that this social discriminatory problem might also be an outcome of the revolution, and that society remembered that women had an equal role, an equal mind and were not only a sexual object. Did society really change? The surprise answer is: ‘No’. The people in Tahrir Square where extremely busy with a democratic cause, busy drawing the future of Egypt and busy thinking strategically, with no discrimination toward their women colleague and partner, standing side by side, asking for the same right. History has been changed from Tahrir Square, but it is still a long way to ensure ideational change about women’s rights as Equal Rights in the private and public space.

Years ago, the world’s women came together to announce a new wave for women’s equality, each with personal or symbolic messages that represented the voice of others. This moment came as a light of hope to millions of women facing injustice, discrimination and inequality. But today, we must face ourselves with the reality on the ground and ask ourselves: Did we work on the road from ideational change to accountability? Did we well acknowledge that women are the missing force behind development, the core for smart economics, the real sign of a developed nation and the real force behind change and democratic transitions?

Peace, Security, Democracy, and Development cannot be achieved without systematically involving women and integrating gender equality perspectives in key political, economic and societal policy decisions. Women are the disadvantaged half of humanity; addressing their well-being and equality will automatically boost the chances of realizing established development objectives. Although women’s conditions may be changing, their status remains unchanged.

---

1. Interview with Nora Rafae, one of the young women who participated with their hearts and souls in the 25th of January Egyptian Revolution.
“I Aspire to Walk” freely in the street; it is a right to walk in a safe environment. Walking and commuting in the streets is not a luxury, rather, for most of the girls and women, it is the affordable way or the only way of commuting from one place to the other. Violence in urban settings has become a common characteristic of living in cities, affecting the quality of life of all its inhabitants. Nonetheless, women and men perceive and experience urban violence in different ways. Public forms of gender-based violence that overwhelmingly affect women and girls are not always clearly defined, much less reported, nor adequately sanctioned, as only a few laws are in place to address them. Beyond violent and delinquent acts based on gender, various forms of discrimination and abuse against women are manifested in modern city life in more subtle ways, including exclusion from political and socio-economic participation and access to services. It is clearly stated in international Human Rights Law that states have a duty and obligation to exercise due diligence to prevent, prosecute and punish Violence Against Women and Girls.

GENDER, URBANIZATION AND SAFETY

Urban Spaces are experienced differently by different people. There is a direct link between Gender, Urbanization and Safety. Safety, the perception that each one feels of the space around them. It is the recognition of women as citizens with legitimate rights to the public space that has the capacity to convert women's relationship to the public space and the public space's reaction to their presence.

Despite the context of urban violence, cities offer women multiple opportunities for their autonomy. Indeed, they are often the stage for expanded freedoms from rigid gender norms and controls on women's life choices and personal development. This underscores the notion


153
that, by definition, cities based on principles of good governance and equality should work to eradicate violence against women and promote their empowerment and equal rights as citizens. The importance of providing a sense of security among women and girls in public spaces cannot be undermined. As a basic human need, the failure to achieve that feeling of security and safety in one’s everyday environment involves various negative consequences taking different forms of anti-social behaviour and attitudes, and would then lead to stress-related outcomes.

In its 2008-2011 Corporate Strategic Plan, UNWOMEN committed to deliver a ‘Safe Cities’ global model inspired by the UN WOMEN Latin American experience, which has been tested and proven through an impact evaluation. The notion of Safe Cities for women is a relatively new and innovative approach put into practice by women’s and grassroots groups in various sites across the world. In addition, UNWOMEN has also committed to start Safe City Interventions in a path to link the Global Program and come up with a model that could be up-scaled in the future.

Also worth noting, ‘proving’ the Safe Cities approach will make a significant contribution to one of the most neglected, but most pressing and strategically important areas within the field of programming on ending violence against women: Prevention. Most experiences to date have focused on responding to survivor needs for justice, care and support. As such, this Safe Cities Programme is also poised to make a very valuable contribution to the wider field of ending violence against women.


THE ECONOMIC IMPACT CALCULATIONS OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

The economic impact calculations of “Violence against Women” (VAW) can vary from one country to the other due to differences in contexts; yet, the economic costs remain too high. WHO believes that domestic violence has an indirect societal impact, “it represents a drain on the economically productive workforce and generates a climate of fear and insecurity.” The “Economic Cost of VAW” mentioned in the Secretary General Report on VAW is not only human costs, but goes beyond lowered economic production and reduced human capital formation; to costs of political and social instability through intergenerational transmission of VAW; The “Social Cost of VAW” prevents women from fully participating in their communities socially or economically. Women who are targeted for violence are less likely to be employed, tend to be employed in low status jobs and are unlikely to be promoted. Sexual violence undermines physical security in public areas and the risk of such violence may increase when women enter public life, constraining their political voice. It reduces the capacity of victims/survivors to contribute productively to the family, the economy and public life. It drains resources from social services, the justice system, healthcare agencies and employers; and it lowers the overall educational attainment, mobility and innovative potential of the victims/survivors.

In Egypt, the story of Noha Roushdi, a 28 year old woman who won a verdict in October 2008 against a driver who sexually harassed her,

gives a brighter insight in the fight for women’s rights. The criminal court sentenced the driver to three years of prison and a fine of 5,001 Egyptian pounds for committing indecent assault. This was the first case of sexual harassment to be filed in court. This sentence sent a message to all segments of Egyptian society that sexual harassment is a crime and will not be tolerated.

STRATEGIC VISION OF THE MODEL IN EGYPT

Building on existing experience, the project in Egypt will follow global initiative aims to refine and rigorously evaluate a model of how local authorities, working in tandem with communities and women’s organizations, can prevent violence against women and girls in public spaces through participatory processes and practical measures. The programme’s longer-term intention, of promoting the model for worldwide adaptation and up-scaling by local governments, encapsulates its full impact potential to reduce gender-based violence, further women’s empowerment, and enhance the quality of city life for all. The programme will provide evidence-based research to guide policies aiming at making cities safe for women and girls. It is important to emphasize that whenever cities are safe for women and girls, they are safe for all. Indeed, women and girls constitute one of the most vulnerable groups in the society and accordingly, they are at higher risk of exposure to urban violence. This vulnerability is gender-based.

UNWOMEN will limit the understanding and scope of ‘Safe Cities Free of Violence against Women’ to gender-based sexual harassment and sexual violence against women and girls committed in urban public spaces such as streets and other public neighbourhood spaces; public spaces of work, both in terms of women’s productive and reproductive roles and responsibilities; public transportation; routes to and from schools and educational institutions; public parks and other recreational and sports facilities; and other public recreational spaces, such as coffee shops.

Thus, in terms of the forms and definitions of violence in focus for this programme, gender-based violence against women and girls (VAW&G) in public spaces is understood to cover: sexual violence, including sexual harassment (verbal, physical); unwanted sexual advances (such as being touched, grabbed or brushed against in a sexual way); rape or attempted rape and fatalities resulting from such violent assault, and degrading remarks or gestures of a sexual nature. Stalking including via use of modern communications technologies (e.g., SMS/texting), an
emerging form of gender-based violence will be included on a case-by-case basis depending on local context. (Note that this definition draws in part on the CEDAW General Recommendation 19 on violence against women). Given the importance that the perception of insecurity plays in affecting women’s mobility, the programme will also measure changes in this regard, since changes in actual levels of crime and security (objective realm) do not always translate to reduced levels of fear (subjective realm).

While the focus will be on sexual harassment and sexual assault in public spaces, in line with the concept of a continuum of violence from private to public spaces, the programme will also assess the degree to which it generates responses to other forms of violence against women, in both public and private spaces (such as incidents of intimate partner violence that occur in public or on streets; kidnapping and abduction for purposes of trafficking or forced marriage practices; acid throwing; and robberies and muggings, in which gender is an aggravating factor increasing women’s vulnerability though they are not necessarily gender-specific forms of crime). Moreover, other forms of crime and violence are anticipated to be positively impacted through the practical safety measures introduced, with benefits for the public at large. The expectation is that, given the programme’s emphasis on public awareness, community mobilization and capacity development of ‘duty bearers’, both public authorities and the public at large will be more likely to react and intervene when witnessing such acts of violence.

In Egypt, UNWOMEN is piloting a Safe City Model, with a wide range of partners, research centres, government and civil society. The strategic vision of the model in Egypt aims to: Apply a Human Rights-based approach and ensure women as citizens claim their rights of


10. For example, as found by an end-line survey in Bogotá that showed that in spite of overall success, the 12-year-long community safety action plan did not lead to decreased perceptions of insecurity. Rojas, C. Forging Civic Culture in Bogotá City, Asian Development Bank, Manila, 2002.
safety in public spaces; Strengthen Women’s Leadership and enhance their capacity to impact policies and mostly policies that are affecting their lives and their human security; Approach Violence against women and girls as a multidimensional problem to be addressed defiantly, given that it implies the intersection of distinct perspectives and thematic areas such as women’s human rights, urban territoriality, participation and citizenship building, the democratic development and management of public policies; and Promote the right to the Safe City for Women and Girls.

The Safe City Model to be implemented in Greater Cairo Region will be framed around:

- Community Development Framework ensuring that the voices of the Right Holders\(^\text{11}\) is reaching out to the Duty Bearers
- Legal Policy Framework ensuring Women and Girls’ Human Rights
- Institutional Framework that ensure National Agreement on Components of Safe City for Women that is sustainable

The Program will employ a series of high impact strategies to maximize the effectiveness of its interventions. UNWOMEN will utilize an integrated community-based approach to address issues and forms of violence against women and girls in the public spaces. As opposed to a top-down strategy in which action is imposed from above, the program will work with and through members of the community to foster power, raise awareness, and provide support. In this way, community members will be able to take action themselves. This strategy will mobilize

\(^{11}\) The primary and secondary beneficiaries of the program. Primary beneficiaries of the Global Programme are women and girls in poor communities that are actual and potential users of the public spaces, where interventions to improve safety will be focused. Secondary beneficiaries include:

- family members, partners, friends and neighbours of primary beneficiaries who suffer when women and girls in their lives experience sexual harassment and sexual violence, or the risks thereof, when they leave their home for work, school or leisure;
- Local women’s organisations, as well as youth, men’s, community and neighbourhoods associations, that will benefit from strengthened knowledge, organisation, advocacy skills and access to local policy-making circles to promote gender-responsive interventions;
- Local government authorities whose policies, programmes and capacities are strengthened to improve the quality of life and safety of residents (and voters), through improved security.
all levels of the community to change existing stereotypes and social norms fuelling violence against girls and women in the public spaces, and to prevent and respond to various forms of violence.

Moreover, the program will employ a media advocacy strategy to combat violence against women. The program will conduct awareness raising campaigns to change community attitudes and behaviours about women and girls’ rights, in addition to establishing partnerships with men and youth networks, youth councils in universities, and media. The program will focus on the Capacity Development of the Right Holders and Duty Bearers[^12], with an ongoing policy-oriented advocacy targeting the private Sector, Local Authorities, National Women Machineries, relevant Line Ministries and Community Organizations. The program will aim at building a Constructive dialogue and partnership between local Government and the Civil Society to ensure Women and Gender equality issues in the Local Budgeting; as well as the planned infrastructure development with the community and Gender Responsive Budgeting with Ministry of Finance as a strategic tool and approach for promoting the accountability and sustainability. Process documentation throughout the implementation, the monitoring as well as the evaluation of the project will create knowledge and evidence-based information that will support the up-scaling on National Level.

The Model is targeting an Operational and Capacity Change in Duty Bearers gained knowledge and skills and partnerships for preventing and responding to VAW&G in public spaces; Right holders gained knowledge and skills and organizational capacities to demand their rights and entitlements; Prevention Campaigns on VAW in Public Spaces Launched and Practical infrastructural safety measures instituted by Local Community and Government.

[^12]: In general, an institution or an elected or appointed official in a country that ought to respect, protect and fulfill its human rights legal obligations, as well as international, national and local laws, policies, and strategies. In the specific context of the United Nations Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the States that have ratified the Convention and are thus duty bound to implement its provisions. In the specific context of the SCGP – any institution or elected or appointed official at a country or local level, with relevant obligations towards adopting and ensuring appropriate legislative, administrative and other measures towards the full realization of human rights, and most notably in relation to safety, and ensuring a violence-free city environment for women, girls and all other inhabitants, within the realm of their authority.
The Tools Employed will be: Capacity gaps analysis; Capacity development program; Capacity building program for health service providers in public clinics/health facilities; Women and Girls Safety Committee on Site Level; Safety Coordinator in the Ministry of Housing Utilities and Urban Development, the General Organization for Physical Planning; Women Safety Audits; Women and Girls Security and Safety Component to be added to the Detailed Plans Surveys for Urban Development, in the selected sites; Local level budget allocations to address safety in public spaces. Develop a Gender Sensitive Accountability Framework for Safe Cities; Community theatre; Media Watch; Online resource centre for VAW in public spaces; Hearing sessions between local communities and local authorities; Sessions with the Members of Parliament and civil society to address legislations regarding sexual harassment and VAW&G in public spaces; Simulation Models with youth to address VAW in public Spaces; Policy briefs, including practical protection, prevention and punishment measures (PPP) on safe cities; Communication Strategy and Outreach Action Plans; a Core Media and Celebrities Group “Champions for Women’s and Girls Rights”; Men Role Models and Champions; Community level watchdog; Conducting awareness activities in coordination with the Islamic International Center, Al Azhar University and the National Council for Human Rights targeting religious leaders, Doaa and community members; National youth discussion on the prevalence of sexual harassment in the cities; Simplified packages on legal illiteracy and human rights at community and grassroots levels; Hotlines; Monitoring mechanism and referral within the Ombudsmen office; Child help hotline on the sexual harassment cases; Friendly women’s shelters; Center of Excellence for the Safe City Interventions on National level and Gender sensitive detailed Infrastructural Urban development Plans.

A great deal of work will be targeted to engender The National Strategy for Urban Planning and Feasibility Studies to ensure active participation of different stakeholders in the Urban Development of the Greater Cairo Region; The Communication Strategy for the startup of the national dialogue on urban development of the Greater Cairo Region; Urban and social profiles of the Greater Cairo Region; Tools for the Urban National Observatory and inclusion of specific indicators related to Safety in the Urban National Observatory.

PARTNERSHIP

The program is developed in partnership with UNDP, UNHABITAT, UNFPA, GTZ and Care, Civil Society, The Social Research Center
The Safe City Model will be applied to the Impact Evaluation design chosen for Greater Cairo Safe City Project and is the Quasi experimental evaluation, using non random sampling with control and treatment groups. The selection of the Slum dwellers was based on the deprivation index that was constructed for most of these sites. They are mostly in the lower to middle areas of the index. The index was constructed based on the physical and social structure of the sites using GIS data available from the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS).

The selected areas (called sheyakha according to CAPMAS administrative division) for impact evaluation, as well as the society organizations are currently on the ground in these regions, which will be working with UN Women in the safe city program. Control regions have been chosen in such a way that they have a close background resemblance in terms of socio-economic and socio-physical structure to the selected areas. They also have a comparable geographical location that permits comparison of the results chain.

The number of sites that have been selected within each region depends on the population density, its total area, and its population size. As each of these regions was actually divided into sub-areas (mantekah as called by CAPMAS), several sites could have been chosen from within. Each site constitutes a neighbourhood within the region itself. It could be a whole mantekah if it is small enough, or a group of streets that constitutes a neighbourhood within each mantekah.

Below is a brief description of each intervention area and its opposed control area:

**Ezbet Al-Haggana (intervention) and Al-Salam Al-Sharkeyah (control)**

Ezbet al-Haggana is located at the east side of Cairo. It is surrounded by rich neighbourhoods to its west and south. It is a poor neighbourhood that suffers from infrastructure, services as well as safety problems according to several studies, including those conducted by Al-Shehab NGO which operates in this area.

Al-Salam Al-Sharkeyah has similar socio-economic, as well as physical and geographical location, to Ezbet Al-Haggana. It is also located...
to the far east of Cairo and that is why it was chosen as a control for Ezbet Al-Haggana.

**Mansheyat Nasser (intervention) and Al-Ebageyah (control)**

Mansheyat Nasser is an illegal settlement on the outskirts of Cairo that emerged in the 1960’s. Mansheyat Nasser occupies a central position within Cairo, located along the base of the Mokattam Hills, directly east of Fatimid Cairo and the associated cemeteries of Gait Bey and Sultan Barquq. Geographically and socially speaking, Mansheyat Nasser is divided into the upper part of the hill, which is inhabited by the *Zabbaleen* or ‘Garbage collectors’ and the lower part of the hill, which is inhabited by a lower middle income and working class community.

According to UN-Habitat, “Mansheyat Nasser is the largest squat-ter/informal area in Cairo. A large section of the area does not have access to running water, sewage systems or electricity. Potable water is limited and the majority of people rely on pit latrines and old septic tanks and obtain their electricity through illegal taps. Most of the roads in Mansheyat Nasser are unpaved and too narrow for normal vehicle traffic. Two-thirds of the population lives in the lower part of Mansheyat Nasser and most of them are immigrants from Upper Egypt. The majority of the inhabitants of the lower part are employed in small businesses or as petty vendors and mostly in the informal sector.

In addition, more than half the population are illegally connected to electricity and the majority rely on pit latrines and septic tanks for waste disposal. The area was once used as a landfill site, so the lower quarry levels are filled with centuries of garbage, resulting in poor foundation conditions vulnerable to leaking sewer and water systems. Health problems arising from the faulty sewage system, as well as from poor nutrition, inadequate vaccinations, and the toxic fumes produced by the burning of waste in the garbage collectors’ area are common. Pockets of insecurity and drug selling are located in the area.

Al-Ebageyah is located close to Mansheyat Nasser and has very close characteristics to those of Mansheyat Nasser and, thus, was chosen as a control.

**Embaba (intervention) and Al-Warrak (control)**

Embaba is to the north of Giza adjacent to the upper scale area of Mohandesseen and falls within the cosmopolitan atmosphere of central Cairo, while Al-Warrak does not. Al-Warrak falls to the north east of Embaba and is more homogeneous, in terms of location and other characteristics, than Embaba.
Embaba is another pocket of deprived neighbourhood in the centre of Greater Cairo and very close to Zamalek and Mohandesseen. The latter two are upper scaled areas. Like all the previous areas, it has a high level of drug selling and overall insecurities in the streets that characterizes these neighbourhoods.

It can be observed that most of these sites are characterized by high levels of unsafety, frequent street fights with use of knives or like-weapons, harassment and drug selling. For example, more than 40% of respondents reported the presence of harassment in the streets in Ezbet Al-Hagganna, while around 50% reported it in Ezbet Khairallah; in the latter area, more than 40% reported strong harassment or, according to the question used in the survey instrument, “harassment that goes beyond reasonable limits.”

During Focus group discussions and field visits to the slum dwellers, when we started asking about harassment and the reasons for the harassment in the streets and why it is escalating, most of our focus group agreed that the reasons were unemployment, unplanned leisure time, no places to play sports and delayed marriage.

Targeting the “missing ingredient”: What is needed?

National Framework: The right to public safety and physical freedom is a basic right guaranteed by the Egyptian constitution.

Governability and Governance: Refers to the Political Legality of the government and the legitimacy constructed in the management of the city. As well as the credibility of public power and broad cooperation between the State and civil society, with spaces and channels for the participation of citizens.

Institutionalization: Regularity / Stability / Management Continuity; a strong and stable organic structure with policies and public programmes for the advancement of women's rights; The existence of Mechanisms that facilitate the development of a Democratic/Participatory Model.

Empowerment of Women: Signs of advancements in building women's citizenship manifest in critical awareness, participatory behaviour, the creation of community-based organizations, women's NGOs, and working networks that will be fundamental partners of the Programme.

Empowerment of Girls: The project aims at promoting girls’ rights and preventing future inherited violence that could be exercised on them.

City to Influence Policy: The goal is democratic organizations, women's organisations, as well as those dedicated to human rights, with the capacity to influence the political agenda, decision-making
processes and the monitoring of public policies. It is related to connections with other organizations, their expertise, and being recognized by government and society.

The Safe City Model is targeting the “missing ingredient” through: Strengthening Community-Base Programming; Working with Partners Boys and Men; Conducting Women’s Safety Audits; Mainstreaming Women and girls’ needs in the Infrastructure development and the Urban Planning and Management; Building Community based Partnerships for Local Action on Women’s Safety; Engendering the Master Urban Development Plans; Including a Safety Component in the conducted surveys for the cities; Producing Evidence-Based Policy Directives.

At the end, making cities responsive to women’s and girls’ needs depends on how spaces are built, managed and governed. We need to think that a planning, social and regulatory intervention might support or help women; changing the mindset and the power relation in the public space is supposed to be the main vehicle to ensure that the rights we are calling for are actually fulfilled.

We are calling for a right to Public Space, Dignity, and Respect. Women should speak up, their voices should be heard, they should stop blaming and accusing themselves for being harassed in the street, and others should stop judging and blaming women, and giving excuses to the men because of economical situations and delayed marriage.

Finally, I do believe that “Women Leaders are Courage in Action, they are the missing force, and they believe that every challenge is nothing more than a chance to make things better”: UNITE, ACT, FOCUS and HAVE ultimate BELIEF in the goodness and righteousness of our CAUSE. The Result is: A Miracle!